Supplements to
Best Practices
for Music Cataloging
Using RDA and MARC21

Supplement 2:
Recording Parallel Data Using ISBD in MARC
and Minimally Punctuated MARC

Version 1.9\(^1\)
15 July 2021

Prepared by the RDA Music Implementation Task Force,
Bibliographic Control Committee, Music Library Association

\(^1\) This supplemental document is intended to accompany the RDA instructions and MLA Best Practices in the RDA Toolkit. This and all previous versions of this document available at [http://cmc.blog.musiclibraryassoc.org/mla-best-practices/](http://cmc.blog.musiclibraryassoc.org/mla-best-practices/)
RDA Music Implementation Task Force

Members³

Casey Mullin, chair
Mary Huismann
Damian Iseminger
Nancy Lorimer
Daniel Paradis
Raymond Schmidt
Hermine Vermeij

Stanford University
University of Minnesota
New England Conservatory of Music
Stanford University
Bibliothèque et Archives nationales du Québec
Wellesley College
University of California—Los Angeles

Content Standards Subcommittee

Tracey Snyder, chair (2012-2016)
Mary Huismann, chair (2016-2020)
Keith Knop, chair (2020-2024)

Cornell University
St. Olaf College
University of Georgia

This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International License. To view a copy of this license, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0/.

³ Affiliations at time of original publication, 2014
Supplement 2. Recording Parallel Data Using ISBD in MARC

The following representative examples are intended to offer guidance for inputting parallel elements using ISBD\(^4\) in MARC and PCC guidelines\(^5\) for minimally punctuated MARC. As these examples are not exhaustive, a brief discussion section follows most examples, in order that the reader may apply the underlying concepts to each unique situation.

Contents

1. Parallel other title information
   - Example 1a

2. Parallel titles and parallel statements of responsibility
   - Example 2a
   - Example 2b

3. Some but not all of the medium of performance etc. is in another language and the medium of performance etc. is part of the title proper
   - Example 3a
   - Example 3b
   - Example 3c
   - Example 3d

4. Multiple instances of parallel data in multiple areas and elements
   - Example 4a
   - Example 4b
   - Example 4c

---


\(^5\) Guidelines: [https://www.loc.gov/aba/pcc/documents/PCC-Guidelines-for-Minimally-Punctuated-MARC-Data-v.1.2.docx](https://www.loc.gov/aba/pcc/documents/PCC-Guidelines-for-Minimally-Punctuated-MARC-Data-v.1.2.docx); training: [https://www.loc.gov/aba/pcc/sct/documents/GuidelinesMinimallyPunctuatedMARC-SCT-2020-01.pptx](https://www.loc.gov/aba/pcc/sct/documents/GuidelinesMinimallyPunctuatedMARC-SCT-2020-01.pptx); FAQ: [https://docs.google.com/document/d/1LWK27zsegofSalaDH8bl_MM8ZzDzn6se9J2nhpWsXs/edit?usp=sharing](https://docs.google.com/document/d/1LWK27zsegofSalaDH8bl_MM8ZzDzn6se9J2nhpWsXs/edit?usp=sharing)
Example 1a. Parallel other title information

Preferred Source

RICHARD STRAUSS

DON QUIXOTE
Symphonic Poem
Sinfonische Dichtung
Op. 35

RDA Elements

Title Proper (2.3.2): Don Quixote
Other Title Information (2.3.4): symphonic poem
Other Title Information (2.3.4): op. 35
Parallel Other Title Information (2.3.5): sinfonische Dichtung
Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (2.4.2): Richard Strauss

Traditional ISBD in MARC

245 10 Don Quixote : $b symphonic poem = sinfonische Dichtung : op. 35 / $c Richard Strauss.

Minimally punctuated MARC

245 10 Don Quixote $b symphonic poem = sinfonische Dichtung : op. 35 $c Richard Strauss
Example 2a. Parallel titles, other title information, and parallel statements of responsibility

Preferred Source

Sergej Prokofjew
Sergei Prokofiev

Aschenbrödel
Zehn Klavierstück aus dem Ballett

Cinderella
Ten Piano Pieces from the Ballet

Opus 97

RDA Elements

Title Proper (2.3.2): Aschenbrödel
Other Title Information (2.3.4): zehn Klavierstück aus dem Ballett
Other Title Information (2.3.4): opus 97
Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (2.4.2): Sergej Prokofjew
Parallel Title Proper (2.3.3): Cinderella
Parallel Other Title Information (2.3.5): ten piano pieces from the ballet
Parallel Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (2.4.3): Sergei Prokofiev

Traditional ISBD in MARC

245 10 Aschenbrödel : $b zehn Klavierstück aus dem Ballett : opus 97 / $c Sergej Prokofjew = Cinderella : ten piano pieces from the ballet / Sergei Prokofiev.

Minimally punctuated MARC

245 10 Aschenbrödel $b zehn Klavierstück aus dem Ballett : opus 97 $c Sergej Prokofjew = Cinderella : ten piano pieces from the ballet / Sergei Prokofiev

Discussion

In ISBD presentation, when a preferred source of information bears one or more parallel titles and/or parallel statements of other title information, and also has statements of responsibility in more than one language and/or script, each statement of responsibility, if given, follows the title or other title information to which it is linguistically related.
(ISBD 1.4.5.10.1). In MARC terms, that means the parallel title, parallel other title information, and parallel statement of responsibility all must go in $c. In such cases it is especially important to include parallel title proper and parallel other title information in field 246 to insure it is properly indexed and searchable. Since “opus 97” is linguistically neutral, it has been included as other title information.

The minimally punctuated version retains punctuation between the other title information and opus number, because the punctuation is internal punctuation appearing within subfield $b, in accordance with PCC guideline 2.3. The punctuation before the parallel title proper; between the parallel title proper and the parallel other title information; and between the parallel other title information and parallel statement of responsibility is also retained as internal punctuation within subfield $c. Other traditional ISBD punctuation is omitted.
Example 2b. Parallel titles, other title information, and parallel statements of responsibility

Preferred Source

Flötenmusik von Komponistinnen
Flute music by female composers

13 Stücke für Flöte und Klavier
13 Pieces for Flute and Piano

Herausgegeben von / Edited by
Elisabeth Weinzierl Wächter und / and Barbara Heller

RDA Elements

Title Proper (2.3.2): Flötenmusik von Komponistinnen
Other Title Information (2.3.4): 13 Stücke für Flöte und Klavier
Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (2.4.2): herausgegeben von
Elisabeth Weinzierl Wächter und Barbara Heller
Parallel Title Proper (2.3.3): Flute music by female composers
Parallel Other Title Information (2.3.5): 13 pieces for flute and piano
Parallel Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (2.4.3): edited by Elisabeth Weinzierl Wächter and Barbara Heller

Traditional ISBD in MARC

245 10 Flötenmusik von Komponistinnen : $b 13 Stücke für Flöte und Klavier / $c herausgegeben von Elisabeth Weinzierl Wächter und Barbara Heller = Flute music by female composers : 13 pieces for flute and piano / edited by Elisabeth Weinzierl Wächter and Barbara Heller.

Minimally punctuated MARC

245 10 Flötenmusik von Komponistinnen $b 13 Stücke für Flöte und Klavier $c herausgegeben von Elisabeth Weinzierl Wächter und Barbara Heller = Flute music by female composers : 13 pieces for flute and piano / edited by Elisabeth Weinzierl Wächter and Barbara Heller

Discussion

In the parallel statement of responsibility naming the editors, the names have been repeated because they are intended to be read twice (see RDA 1.7.7). In this example,
applying RDA 1.7.7 results in exact parallel equivalents for title proper, other title information, and statement of responsibility relating to title proper.

In ISBD presentation, when more than one element within a single area is recorded in two or more languages, the elements in the same language are given together using appropriate preceding punctuation for each element within that language. The subsequent language groups are preceded by space = space (see ISBD Consolidated A.3.2.9). Additionally, each statement of responsibility, if given, follows the title or other title information to which it is linguistically related (ISBD 1.4.5.10.1).

In MARC terms, that means the parallel title, parallel other title information, and parallel statement of responsibility all must go in $c. In such cases it is especially important to include parallel title proper and parallel other title information in field 246 to insure it is properly indexed and searchable.

In the minimally punctuated version, the space = space preceding the parallel language group, the space : space preceding the parallel other title information, and the space / space preceding the parallel statement of responsibility relating to title proper have all been retained as they are internal to $c, as per PCC guideline 2.3. All other traditional ISBD punctuation has been omitted.
Example 3a. Some, but not all, of the medium of performance, etc. is in another language and the medium of performance, etc. is part of the title proper

Preferred Source

FELIX MENDELSSOHN BARTHOLDY

OCTET

For 4 Violins, 2 Violas and 2 Violoncellos

E♭ major/Es-Dur/MI♭ majeur

Op. 20

RDA Elements

Title Proper (2.3.2): Octet for 4 violins, 2 violas and 2 violoncellos E♭ major op. 20
Parallel Title Proper (2.3.3): Es-Dur
Parallel Title Proper (2.3.3): mi♭ majeur
Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (2.4.2): Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy

Traditional ISBD in MARC

245 10 Octet for 4 violins, 2 violas and 2 violoncellos E♭ major op. 20 = $b Es-Dur = mi♭ majeur / $c Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy.

Minimally punctuated MARC

245 10 Octet for 4 violins, 2 violas and 2 violoncellos E♭ major op. 20 $b = Es-Dur = mi♭ majeur $c Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy

Discussion

The medium of performance, key, and number are considered to be part of the title proper because the title is a type of composition (see RDA 2.3.2.8.1). Since “Op. 20” is linguistically neutral, it has been included as part of the title proper. For the parallel title proper, RDA 2.3.3.4 applies since a statement of medium of performance, key, date of composition, and/or number is being treated as part of the title proper and the statement is in more than one language. Even though just the key is in multiple languages, it can be considered as a parallel title proper.

The minimally punctuated version retains the space = space between the title proper and first parallel title proper and between the first and second parallel titles proper is
retained in accordance with PCC guidelines 1.2.6 and 2.3.2. The = before the first title proper is moved from the end of $a$ to the beginning of $b$ in accordance with PCC guideline 1.2.6. Other traditional ISBD punctuation is omitted.
Example 3b. Some, but not all, of the medium of performance, etc. is in another language and the medium of performance etc. is part of the title proper

Preferred Source

SERGE PROKOFIEFF
PIANO CONCERTO No. 3
C MAJOR * DO MAYOR
OP. 26

RDA Elements

Title Proper (2.3.2): Piano concerto no. 3 C major op. 26
Parallel Title Proper (2.3.3): do mayor
Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (2.4.2): Serge Prokofieff

Traditional ISBD in MARC

245 10 Piano concerto no. 3 C major op. 26 = $b do mayor / $c Serge Prokofieff.

Minimally punctuated MARC

245 10 Piano concerto no. 3 C major op. 26 $b = do mayor $c Serge Prokofieff

Discussion

The medium of performance, key, and number are considered part of the title proper because the title is a type of composition (see RDA 2.3.2.8.1). Since “Op. 26” is linguistically neutral, it has been included as part of the title proper. For the parallel title proper, RDA 2.3.3.4 applies since a statement of medium of performance, key, date of composition, and/or number is being treated as part of the title proper and the statement is in more than one language. Even though just the key is in multiple languages, it can be considered as a parallel title proper.

The minimally punctuated version retains and relocates the = between the title proper and parallel title proper from the end of $a to the beginning of $b in accordance with PCC guideline 1.2.6. Other traditional ISBD punctuation is omitted.
Example 3c. Some, but not all, of the medium of performance, etc. is in another language and the medium of performance etc. is part of the title proper

Preferred Source

WOLFGANG AMADEUS MOZART

MISSA
for 4 solo voices, chorus and orchestra
für 4 Solostimmen, Chor und Orchester
C minor / c-Moll / Ut mineur
K 427
Edited by / Herausgegeben von
H. C. Robbins Landon

RDA Elements

Title Proper (2.3.2): Missa for 4 solo voices, chorus and orchestra C minor K 427
Parallel Title Proper (2.3.3): für 4 Solostimmen, Chor und Orchester c-Moll
Parallel Title Proper (2.3.3): ut mineur
Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (2.4.2): Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart
Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (2.4.2): edited by H.C. Robbins Landon
Parallel Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (2.4.3): herausgegeben von H.C. Robbins Landon

Traditional ISBD in MARC


Minimally punctuated MARC

245 10 Missa for 4 solo voices, chorus and orchestra C minor K 427 $b = für 4 Solostimmen, Chor und Orchester c-Moll = ut mineur $c Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart ; edited by H.C. Robbins Landon = herausgegeben von H.C. Robbins Landon

Discussion

The medium of performance, key, and number are considered part of the title proper because the title, even though it is in Latin, is a type of composition (see RDA 2.3.2.8.1). Since “K 427” is linguistically neutral, it has been included as part of the title proper. For the two parallel titles proper, RDA 2.3.3.4 applies since a statement of medium of performance,
key, date of composition, and/or number is being treated as part of the title proper and the statement is in more than one language.

For the transcription of the parallel statement of responsibility naming H.C. Robbins Landon, the name has been repeated because it is intended to be read twice (see RDA 1.7.7).

The minimally punctuated version retains and relocates the space = space between the title proper and first parallel title proper from the end of $a to the beginning of $b in accordance with PCC guideline 1.2.6. The space = space between the first and second parallel title proper is internal punctuation and retained in accordance with PCC guideline 2.3.2. The space ; space between the first and second statements of responsibility relating to parallel title proper and the space = space between the second statements of responsibility relating to parallel title proper and the parallel statement of responsibility relating to title proper are internal punctuation and retained in accordance with PCC guideline 2.3.1 and 2.3.2. Other traditional ISBD punctuation is omitted.
Example 3d. Some, but not all, of the medium of performance, etc. is in another language and the medium of performance etc. is part of the title proper

Preferred Source

Florentine Mulsant

Concerto
pour Piccolo et Orchestre
op. 72, 2017

für Piccoloflöte und Orchester
for piccolo and orchestra

RDA Elements

Title Proper (2.3.2): Concerto pour piccolo et orchestre op. 72, 2017
Parallel Title Proper (2.3.3): für Piccoloflöte und Orchester
Parallel Title Proper (2.3.3): for piccolo and orchestra
Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (2.4.2): Florentine Mulsant

Traditional ISBD in MARC

245 10 Concerto pour piccolo et orchestre op. 72, 2017 = $b für Piccoloflöte und Orchester = for piccolo and orchestra / $c Florentine Mulsant.

Minimally punctuated MARC

245 10 Concerto pour piccolo et orchestre op. 72, 2017 $b = für Piccoloflöte und Orchester = for piccolo and orchestra $c Florentine Mulsant

Discussion

The medium of performance, number, and date of composition are considered to be part of the title proper because the title is a type of composition (see RDA 2.3.2.8.1). Since “op. 72” and “2017” are linguistically neutral, they have been included as part of the title proper. For the parallel title proper, RDA 2.3.3.4 applies since a statement of medium of performance, key, date of composition, and/or number is being treated as part of the title proper and the statement is in more than one language. Even though only the medium of performance is in multiple languages, it can be considered as a parallel title proper.
The minimally punctuated version retains and relocates the = between the title proper and parallel title proper from the end of $a$ to the beginning of $b$ in accordance with PCC guideline 1.2.6. The remaining space = space is retained as internal to $b$, per PCC guideline 2.3. Other traditional ISBD punctuation is omitted.
Example 4a. Multiple instances of parallel data in multiple areas and elements

Preferred Source

PHILHARMONIA
PARTITUREN * SCORES * PARTITIONS

ALBAN BERG

LYRISCHE SUITE
LYRIC SUITE / SUITE LYRIQUE

für Streichquartett
for String Quartet / pour Quatuor à Cordes

RDA Elements

Title Proper (2.3.2): Lyrische Suite
Parallel Title Proper (2.3.3): Lyric suite
Parallel Title Proper (2.3.3): Suite lyrique
Other Title Information (2.3.4): für Streichquartett
Parallel Other Title Information (2.3.5): for string quartet
Parallel Other Title Information (2.3.5): pour quatuor à cordes
Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (2.4.2): Alban Berg
Title Proper of Series (2.12.2): Philharmonia Partituren
Parallel Title Proper of Series (2.12.3): Philharmonia scores
Parallel Title Proper of Series (2.12.3): Philharmonia partitions

Traditional ISBD in MARC

...
490 0_ Philharmonia Partituren = $a Philharmonia scores = $a Philharmonia partitions

Minimally punctuated MARC

245 10 Lyrische Suite $b für Streichquartett = Lyric suite : for string quartet = Suite lyrique : pour quatuor à cordes $c Alban Berg
...
490 0_ Philharmonia Partituren $a = Philharmonia scores $a = Philharmonia partitions
Discussion

In ISBD presentation, when more than one element within a single area is recorded in two or more languages, the elements in the same language are given together using appropriate preceding punctuation for each element within that language. The subsequent language groups are preceded by space = space (see ISBD Consolidated A.3.2.9). The statement of responsibility is recorded after all the parallel data because it has no other language forms (see ISBD Consolidated 1.4.5.10.3). For the parallel title proper of series, “Philharmonia” is repeated because it is intended to be read more than once (see RDA 1.7.7).

In the 245 field, the minimally punctuated version retains punctuation before each parallel title proper and before each parallel other title information, because the punctuation is internal to the subfield $b$ in accordance with PCC guideline 2.3. Other traditional ISBD punctuation in the 245 field is omitted. In the 490 field, the = before the second and third parallel title proper of series is retained and relocated after the second and third subfields $a$ in accordance with PCC guideline 1.2.6.
Example 4b. Multiple instances of parallel data in multiple areas and elements

*Preferred Source*

**Ludwig van Beethoven**

**Konzert in C**  
Für Klavier, Violine, Violoncello und Orchester  
>>Tripelkonzert<<

**Concerto in C major**  
For piano, violin, cello and orchestra  
>>Triple Concerto<<

op. 56

Herausgegeben von / Edited by  
Bernard van der Linde

*Cover*

Bärenreiter  
Studienpartituren  
Study scores  
285

*RDA Elements*

Title Proper (2.3.2): Konzert in C für Klavier, Violine, Violoncello und Orchester op. 56  
Parallel Title Proper (2.3.3): Concerto in C major for piano, violin, cello and orchestra  
Other Title Information (2.3.4): Tripelkonzert  
Parallel Other Title Information (2.3.5): Triple concerto  
Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (2.4.2): Ludwig van Beethoven  
Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (2.4.2): herausgegeben von Bernard van der Linde  
Parallel Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (2.4.3): edited by Bernard van der Linde  
Title Proper of Series (2.12.2): Bärenreiter Studienpartituren  
Parallel Title Proper of Series (2.12.3): Bärenreiter study scores  
Numbering Within Series (2.12.9): 285
**Traditional ISBD in MARC**

245 10 Konzert in C für Klavier, Violine, Violoncello und Orchester op. 56 : $b Tripelkonzert = Concerto in C major for piano, violin, cello and orchestra : Triple concerto / $c Ludwig van Beethoven ; herausgegeben von Bernard van der Linde = edited by Bernard van der Linde.

... 490 0_ Bärenreiter Studienpartituren = $a Bärenreiter study scores ; $v 285

**Minimally punctuated MARC**

245 10 Konzert in C für Klavier, Violine, Violoncello und Orchester op. 56 $b Tripelkonzert = Concerto in C major for piano, violin, cello and orchestra : Triple concerto $c Ludwig van Beethoven ; herausgegeben von Bernard van der Linde = edited by Bernard van der Linde

... 490 0_ Bärenreiter Studienpartituren $a = Bärenreiter study scores $v 285

**Discussion**

The medium of performance, key, and number are considered to be part of the title proper because the title is a type of composition (see RDA 2.3.2.8.1). Since “op. 56” is linguistically neutral, it has been included as part of the title proper.

In ISBD presentation, when more than one element within a single area is recorded in two or more languages, the elements in the same language are given together using appropriate preceding punctuation for each element within that language. The subsequent language groups are preceded by space = space (see ISBD Consolidated A.3.2.9). This justifies the presentation of all the German titles together, followed by the English titles. The statements of responsibility follow all the parallel titles since it is not possible or would be difficult to put the statements of responsibility with each corresponding title grouping (see ISBD Consolidated 1.4.5.10.2)

For the transcription of the parallel statement of responsibility naming Bernard van der Linde, the name has been repeated because it is intended to be read twice (see RDA 1.7.7). The same is also true of the transcription of the parallel title proper of series.

In the minimally punctuated version of the 245 field, the space = space preceding the parallel title proper, the space : space preceding the parallel other title information, the space ; space preceding the second statement of responsibility relating to title proper, and the space = space preceding the parallel statement of responsibility relating to title proper are retained because they are internal punctuation, in accordance with PCC guideline 2.3. Other traditional ISBD punctuation in the 245 field is omitted. In the 490 field, the = before the parallel title proper of series is retained and relocated after the
second subfield $a$ in accordance with PCC guideline 1.2.6. The space ; space preceding the numbering within series statement is omitted in accordance with PCC guideline 1.2.4.
Example 4c. Multiple instances of parallel data in multiple areas and elements

Preferred Source

Johann Sebastian

BACH

Auf Christi Himmelfahrt allein
On Jesus Christ's ascent on high
BWV 128

Kantate zum Fest Christi Himmelfahrt
für Soli (ATB), Chor (SATB)
2 Oboen, Oboe d'amore, Oboe da caccia, Trompete, 2 Hörner
2 Violinen, Viola und Basso continuo
herausgegeben von Julia Ronge

Cantata for Ascension Day
for soli (ATB), choir (SATB)
2 oboes, oboe d'amore, oboe da caccia, trumpet, 2 horns
2 violins, viola and basso continuo
edited by Julia Ronge
English version by Henry S. Drinker

Klavierauszug/Vocal score
Paul Horn

RDA Elements

Title Proper (2.3.2): Auf Christi Himmelfahrt allein
Parallel Title Proper (2.3.3): On Jesus Christ's ascent on high
Other Title Information (2.3.4): BWV 128
Other Title Information (2.3.4): Kantate zum Fest Christi Himmelfahrt für Soli (ATB), Chor (SATB), 2 Oboen, Oboe d'amore, Oboe da caccia, Trompete, 2 Hörner, 2 Violinen, Viola und Basso continuo
Parallel Other Title Information (2.3.5): cantata for Ascension Day for soli (ATB), choir (SATB), 2 oboes, oboe d'amore, oboe da caccia, trumpet, 2 horns, 2 violins, viola and basso continuo
Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (2.4.2): Johann Sebastian Bach
Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (2.4.2): herausgegeben von Julia Ronge
Parallel Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (2.4.3): edited by Julia Ronge
Statement of Responsibility Relating to Title Proper (2.4.2): English version by Henry S. Drinker
Designation of Edition (2.5.2): Klavierauszug
Parallel Designation of Edition (2.5.3): Vocal score
Statement of Responsibility Relating to the Edition (2.5.4): Paul Horn

**Traditional ISBD in MARC**

245 10 Auf Christi Himmelfahrt allein = $b On Jesus Christ's ascent on high : BWV 128 : Kantate zum Fest Christi Himmelfahrt für Soli (ATB), Chor (SATB), 2 Oboen, Oboe d'amore, Oboe da caccia, Trompete, 2 Hörner, 2 Violinen, Viola und Basso continuo = cantata for Ascension Day for soli (ATB), choir (SATB), 2 oboes, oboe d'amore, oboe da caccia, trumpet, 2 horns, 2 violins, viola and basso continuo / $c Johann Sebastian Bach ; herausgegeben von Julia Ronge = edited by Julia Ronge ; English version by Henry S. Drinker.

250 Klavierauszug = $b Vocal score / Paul Horn.

**Minimally punctuated MARC**

245 10 Auf Christi Himmelfahrt allein $b = On Jesus Christ's ascent on high : BWV 128 : Kantate zum Fest Christi Himmelfahrt für Soli (ATB), Chor (SATB), 2 Oboen, Oboe d'amore, Oboe da caccia, Trompete, 2 Hörner, 2 Violinen, Viola und Basso continuo = cantata for Ascension Day for soli (ATB), choir (SATB), 2 oboes, oboe d'amore, oboe da caccia, trumpet, 2 horns, 2 violins, viola and basso continuo $c Johann Sebastian Bach ; herausgegeben von Julia Ronge = edited by Julia Ronge ; English version by Henry S. Drinker

250 Klavierauszug $b = Vocal score / Paul Horn

**Discussion**

In general, ISBD favors that languages are grouped together when there is parallel data across elements within the same area (see ISBD Consolidated A.3.2.9). It appears that one could group the German language elements of the title proper and other title information together, followed by the English titles.

However, the presence of “BWV 128” presents a problem since it is linguistically neutral and has no parallel form. Should it follow after all the parallel title statements, but before the statement of responsibility or should it be given after the parallel title proper, but before the other title information in German, which would then be followed by the other title information in English? Unfortunately, ISBD is silent on this specific situation. However, RDA 2.3.4.3 does say that if more than one element of other title
information is recorded, it should be recorded in the order indicated by the sequence, layout, or typography of the elements on the source of information. This provides enough justification to place “Kantate zum Fest Christi Himmelfahrt für Soli (ATB), Chor (SATB), 2 Oboen, Oboe d'amore, Oboe da caccia, Trompete, 2 Hörner, 2 Violinen, Viola und Basso continuo” directly after “BWV 128,” thus separating the presentation of the title proper and parallel title proper from the other title and other parallel title information.

In the minimally punctuated version of the 245 field, the = before the parallel title proper is retained and relocated to the beginning of subfield b in accordance with PCC guideline 1.2.6. The colons preceding both other title information statements, the space = space preceding the parallel other title information, and the space ; space preceding the second and third statements of responsibility relating to title proper, and the space = space preceding the parallel statement of responsibility relating to title proper are retained because they are internal punctuation, in accordance with PCC guideline 2.3. Other traditional ISBD punctuation in the 245 field is omitted. In the 250 field, the = before the parallel designation of edition is retained and relocated to be beginning of subfield b in accordance with PCC guideline 1.2.6. The space / space preceding the statement of responsibility relating to the edition is retained because it is internal punctuation, in accordance with PCC guideline 2.3.
## Index of Concepts Illustrated

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Concept</th>
<th>Page(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>date of composition in title proper</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>key, parallel</td>
<td>9, 11, 12, 19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>language grouping</td>
<td>8, 17, 19, 22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>linguistically neutral text</td>
<td>6, 9, 11, 13, 14, 19, 23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>medium of performance, parallel</td>
<td>12, 19, 22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>numbering within series</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>numbers, work/serial/opus</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in other title information</td>
<td>4, 5, 21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in title proper</td>
<td>9, 11, 12, 14, 18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ordering of elements</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ambiguous</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>statement of responsibility</td>
<td>6, 8, 17, 19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>parallel elements</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>designation of edition</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>other title information</td>
<td>4, 5, 7, 16, 18, 21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>statement of responsibility relating to title proper</td>
<td>5, 7, 12, 18, 22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>title proper</td>
<td>5, 7, 9, 11, 12, 16, 18, 21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>title proper of series</td>
<td>16, 19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>text intended to be read more than once</td>
<td>8, 13, 17, 19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>title and other title information in 245 $c</td>
<td>6, 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>types of composition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>as part of a distinctive title</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>as title proper</td>
<td>9, 11, 12, 14, 18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in other title information</td>
<td>4, 5, 7, 21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>