The following summary of JSC decisions relating to the discussion of the LC/12 suite of documents is excerpted from the June 5, 2009 *Report on the March 2009 JSC meeting* by John Attig, ALA Representative to the Joint Steering Committee. For the full report, addressing all areas of RDA, see http://www.libraries.psu.edu/tas/jca/ccda/docs/jsc0904.pdf

Identifying musical works and expressions in Chapter 6

In addition to the full draft of RDA, the JSC agenda included a major set of proposals from the Library of Congress (the *5JSC/LC/12* series) dealing with the instructions for recording attributes and constructing access points for musical works and expressions. These proposals were both extensive and contentious. In spite of the limited time available, the JSC managed to agree on a significant number of changes to the text of RDA. This was made possible by a lot of hard work. Kathy Glennan, Mark Scharff and other members of the Music Library Association identified areas of agreement and disagreement. Kathy and Mark subsequently worked extensively with Daniel Paradis (representing the CCC music positions) to document proposals supported by both ALA and CCC. Finally, Barbara Tillett and Judy Kuhagen compiled a list of the areas of agreement between ALA, CCC and LC. Kathy and Mark joined me in presenting the ALA position.

The following decisions were made:

✓ An exception that allows the preferred titles of a numbered sequence of works in a particular form (e.g., the nine Beethoven symphonies) to be consistently formulated was moved from the instructions on recording the preferred title (6.15.2.4) to the instructions on choosing the preferred title (6.15.2.3) and reworded:

> If all of a composer's works with titles that include the name of a type of composition are also cited as a numbered sequence of compositions of that type, use the name of the type of composition as the preferred title.

> > Symphonies
> > *Resource described:* Sinfonia eroica / composta da Luigi van Beethoven. *Also cited in lists of the composer's symphonies as no. 3*

✓ The instruction to delete initial articles from the preferred title was deleted in 6.15.2.4 because an earlier instruction had already specified that omission.

✓ The special instruction for trio sonatas (6.15.2.7) was deleted, as this is covered by other instructions; however, the special instruction on duets (6.15.2.6) was retained.

✓ The instructions on recording the preferred title of a part of a musical work (6.15.2.8.1) were revised:

> Record the preferred title for a part of a musical work applying the instructions given under 6.15.2.4, as applicable. Apply the additional instructions given under 6.15.2.8.1.1– 6.15.2.8.1.5 below as appropriate.

✓ The scope of Medium of performance (6.16.1.1) was revised:

> **Medium of performance** is the instrument, instruments, voice, voices, etc., for which a musical work was originally conceived.

- ✓ The instructions and table under Standard combination of instruments (6.16.1.5) was reworded to make the instructions clearer. There will be three columns: (a) the name of the "standard combination"; (b) "instrumentation" (the list of instruments); and (c) the "term recorded" in the Medium of performance element.

- ✓ The instructions for one or more solo instrument (6.16.1.9) was reworded to combine the two paragraphs in the full draft:

  > For a work for one or more solo instruments and accompanying ensemble, record the term for the solo instrument or instruments and the term for the accompanying ensemble, in that order, applying the instructions given under 6.16.1.4–6.16.1.8.

- ✓ The instructions for recording general terms for voices (6.16.1.10, 3rd paragraph) were revised to clarify when such terms should be recorded:

  > Record one of the following terms for two or more solo voices of different ranges if no specific voice types or ranges can be ascertained.
  >
  > > mixed solo voices
  > >
  > > men's solo voices
  > >
  > > women's solo voices

- ✓ Minor revisions were made to the instructions on Choruses (6.16.1.11).

- ✓ The instructions on Indeterminate medium of performance (6.16.1.13) were revised. The result is an order of priority to be followed when there is no stated medium: (a) a family of instruments; (b) range or general instrument type, e.g., treble instrument, melody instrument, male voice; (c) "unspecified instruments"; (d) "voices" followed by the number of parts, e.g., voices (3); (e) "unspecified".

- ✓ The caption at 6.17.1 was changed to "Numeric designation of a musical work"; a new second paragraph was added to 6.17.1.3.1, dealing with inconsistent numbering of a series of compositions; 6.17.1.3.3 was revised to allow all types of numeric designations to be recorded in this element, not just the one (or more) that will be included in the authorized access point. In 6.28.1.11, the instruction will be to use "one or more of the following" elements in the access point:

  > a) a term indicating medium of performance (see 6.14)
  >
  > b) a numeric designation (see 6.17)
  >
  > c) key (see 6.18)

- ✓ The definition and instructions on recording the key (6.18) was revised to remove the distinction between pre-20th-century and post-19th-century works and to clarify that "Key is designated by its pitch name and its mode, when it is major or minor".

- ✓ A proposal to combine several instructions into a single instruction on "Collaborative works" at 6.28.1.1 was rejected. The instructions included both collaborations in creating new works and "collaborations" between a composer and a later adapter/arranger. The JSC were unwilling to expand the concept of collaboration to this extent.

- ✓ In 6.28.1.3, the phrase "single song" was changed to "single excerpt".

- ✓ 6.28.1.4 was deleted because it deals with non-musical works and is covered by the general instructions.
- ✓ The scope of 6.28.1.5 was reworded: "For a musical work composed for choreographic movement, such as a ballet, pantomime, etc., …"
- ✓ The caption at 6.28.1.7 was changed to "Operas and other dramatic works with new text and title".
- ✓ Additional instructions were added to the section on cadenzas (6.28.1.8) to deal with cadenzas that do not have titles.
- ✓ The scope of the instructions for Music or incidental music composed for dramatic works (6.28.1.9) will be expanded to cover "a dramatic work, film, etc."
- ✓ The instructions to base the authorized access point for a libretto on the authorized access point for the musical work (6.28.1.10) were deleted, because librettos as such are not musical works; authorized access points for librettos will follow the general instructions and will include the authorized access point for the author of the libretto.
- ✓ A new instruction was added (6.27.4.2.1) to allow for a variant access point with the libretto treated as a part of the musical work. This variant access point would include the authorized access point for the composer and the preferred title of the musical work, followed by "Libretto."
- ✓ A new instruction was added (6.28.4.2) to allow for a variant access point with the cadenza treated as a part of the musical work, instead of an independent work. The authorized access point would include the authorized access point for the composer of the cadenza, and the variant access point would include the authorized access point for the composer of the larger musical work.
- ✓ The caption and scope at 6.28.1.11 was changed to "Additions to access points representing musical works with titles that are not distinctive" and the caption and scope at 6.28.1.12 was changed to "Additions to access points for musical works with distinctive titles".
- ✓ The instructions for musical sketches (6.28.3.4) was revised (and an example added):

  > Construct the authorized access point representing a work or part or parts of a work consisting of a composer's sketches by adding *Sketches* to the authorized access point representing the completed work.

- ✓ The instructions on librettos as musical expressions (6.28.3.6) were deleted; librettos are being treated as related works.
- ✓ "Variant" was added to "access point" in a few instructions in which it was missing (6.28.4.1–6.28.4.4.

There were a number of comments on other parts of RDA that were related to this discussion:

- ✓ It was agreed to remove the limitation on the number of instruments, voices, etc., that may be recorded as Medium of performance. [7.21.1.3]

- ✓ In the Glossary, a definition of "Distinctive title" was added; "Non-distinctive title" will not be added; the term "Type of musical composition" (with "musical" deleted) will be retained and revised.

There was agreement that any issues in the LC/12 documents not discussed will be deferred until after the first release of RDA. The list of unresolved issues includes:

- ✓ Concern that the instructions on recording attributes of a musical work are being driven by the need to use these attributes without addition, deletion, or modification when constructing access points.
- ✓ Naming of "large ensembles": beyond *orchestra*, *string orchestra*, and *band*, what terms should be allowed?
- ✓ The arranger, adapter, etc., for folk music, world music, etc., should be treated the creator, not simply as the contributor of "added accompaniment".
- ✓ Non-distinctive titles: There is still no agreement on how to define or enumerate non-distinctive titles. Options included reference to an external list and an expanded list in RDA; the instructions need to include the concept of cognates in order to provide consistent treatment of titles in various languages.
- ✓ Revisions are needed to the instructions for naming complete literary works of a composer and complete musical works of an author.
- ✓ Rearrangement of the instructions for Medium of performance.
- ✓ Instructions relating to the order of instruments/voices in the Medium of performance.
- ✓ Clarification of the instructions relating to works for one performer to a part.
- ✓ Clarification of when to list individual instruments/voices in the Medium of performance and when to record names of groups of instruments/voices.
- ✓ Identifying when to record the predominant keyboard instrument in medium statements for keyboard works by a single composer and when to record an unspecified "keyboard instrument".
- ✓ Clarification of when modifications to a musical work result in a new musical work.